ECONOMICS OF EDUCATION REVIEW

DESCRIPTION

_Economics of Education Review_ publishes research on education policy and finance, human capital production and acquisition, and the returns to human capital. We accept empirical, methodological and theoretical contributions, but the main focus of _Economics of Education Review_ is on applied studies that employ micro data and clear identification strategies. Our goal is to publish innovative, cutting-edge research on the economics of education that is of interest to academics, policymakers and the public.

Starting with papers submitted March 1, 2014, the review process for articles submitted to _Economics of Education Review_ will no longer be double blind. Authors are requested to include a title page with authors' names and affiliation. Reviewers will continue to be anonymous.

**Benefits to authors**

We also provide many author benefits, such as free PDFs, a liberal copyright policy, special discounts on Elsevier publications and much more. Please click here for more information on our author services.

Please see our Guide for Authors for information on article submission. If you require any further information or help, please visit our Support Center.

AUDIENCE

Economists, specialists in education finance, educational administrators, researchers interested in the economic dimensions of education, educational researchers in comparative and international education.

IMPACT FACTOR

2018: 1.519 © Clarivate Analytics Journal Citation Reports 2019
ABSTRACTING AND INDEXING

Journal of Economic Literature  
Social Sciences Citation Index  
ERIC  
Journal of Economic Literature  
Engineering Village - GEOBASE  
Social SciSearch  
UnCover  
PubMed/Medline  
Australian Educational Index  
Contents Pages in Education  
ERA (Educational Research Abstracts Online)  
Research into Higher Education Abstracts  
Sociology of Education Abstracts  
Technical Education & Training Abstracts  
Education Research Index  
Periodicals Index Online  
Scopus  
Current Contents  
MathEduc  
VOCEDplus  
RePEc

EDITORIAL BOARD

Editor-in-Chief  
Celeste K. Carruthers, The University of Tennessee System, Knoxville, Tennessee, 37996, United States

Co-Editors  
M. Blackburn, University of South Carolina, Columbia, South Carolina, United States  
G. Brunello, University of Padua, Padova, Italy  
M. Fitzpatrick, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York, United States  
C.P. Harmon, The University of Sydney, Sydney, New South Wales, Australia  
S. Imberman, Michigan State University, East Lansing, Michigan, United States  
D. Jones, University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania, United States  
C. Koedel, University of Missouri, Columbia, Missouri, United States  
S. McNally, London School of Economics and Political Science, London, United Kingdom  
J. Price, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah, United States  
D. Webber, Temple University, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, United States  
D. Webbink, Erasmus University Rotterdam, Rotterdam, Netherlands

Editorial Board  
J. Behrman, University of Pennsylvania, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, United States  
E. Bettinger, Stanford University, Stanford, California, United States  
B. Chapman, Australian National University, Canberra, Australia  
C.T. Clotfelter, Duke University, Durham, North Carolina, United States  
K. Cortes, Texas A&M University College Station, College Station, Texas, United States  
S. DesJardins, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan, United States  
A. Dills, Providence College, Providence, Rhode Island, United States  
R. Ehrenberg, Cornell University, Ithaca, New York, United States  
E.R. Eide, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah, United States  
G. de Fraja, University of Leicester, Leicester, United Kingdom  
P. Glewwe, University of Minnesota Department of Applied Economics, St. Paul, Minnesota, United States  
D. Goldhaber, University of Washington, Seattle, Washington, United States  
A. Griffith, Wake Forest University, Winston-Salem, North Carolina, United States  
E. Hanushek, Stanford University, Stanford, California, United States  
J. Hartog, Tinbergen Institute, Amsterdam, Netherlands  
R. Hernández-Julián, Metropolitan State University of Denver, Denver, Colorado, United States  
G. Lassibille, University of Burgundy, Dijon, France  
H.M. Levin, Columbia University, New York, New York, United States  
M. Lindahl, Uppsala University, Uppsala, Sweden  
B.P. McCall, University of Michigan, Ann Arbor, Michigan, United States
P. McEwan, Wellesley College, Wellesley, Massachusetts, United States
R.J. Murnane, Harvard University, Cambridge, Massachusetts, United States
H. Oosterbeek, University of Amsterdam, Amsterdam, Netherlands
D.I. Rees, University of Colorado Denver, Dept. of Economics, Denver, Colorado, United States
R. Rumberger, University of California Santa Barbara, Santa Barbara, California, United States
M.H. Showalter, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah, United States
P. Siminski, University of Technology Sydney Faculty of Business, Haymarket, Australia
L. Singell, Jr., Indiana University Bloomington College of Arts and Sciences, Bloomington, Indiana, United States
A. Tansel, Middle East Technical University, Ankara, Turkey
J. Tobias, Purdue University, West Lafayette, Indiana, United States
D. Webber, Temple University, Philadelphia, Pennsylvania, United States
L. Woessmann, Ludwig Maximilians University Munich, Munich, Germany
R. Zimmer, Vanderbilt University, Nashville, Tennessee, United States
GUIDE FOR AUTHORS

Your Paper Your Way
Starting with papers submitted March 1, 2014, the review process for articles submitted to the Economics of Education Review will no longer be double blind. Authors are requested to include a title page with authors’ names and affiliation. Reviewers will continue to be anonymous.

INTRODUCTION
Authors are requested to submit their papers electronically by using the Economics of Education Review online submission and review web site (http://ees.elsevier.com/ecoedu). This site will guide authors stepwise through the submission process. Authors are requested to submit the text, tables, and artwork in electronic form to this address. The Publisher and Editor regret that they are not able to consider submissions that do not follow these procedures. At this time, no submission fee is required.

Submission checklist
You can use this list to carry out a final check of your submission before you send it to the journal for review. Please check the relevant section in this Guide for Authors for more details.

Ensure that the following items are present:

One author has been designated as the corresponding author with contact details:
- E-mail address
- Full postal address

All necessary files have been uploaded:
Manuscript:
- Include keywords
- All figures (include relevant captions)
- All tables (including titles, description, footnotes)
- Ensure all figure and table citations in the text match the files provided
- Indicate clearly if color should be used for any figures in print

Graphical Abstracts / Highlights files (where applicable)

Supplemental files (where applicable)

Further considerations
- Manuscript has been 'spell checked' and 'grammar checked'
- All references mentioned in the Reference List are cited in the text, and vice versa
- Permission has been obtained for use of copyrighted material from other sources (including the Internet)
- A competing interests statement is provided, even if the authors have no competing interests to declare
- Journal policies detailed in this guide have been reviewed
- Referee suggestions and contact details provided, based on journal requirements

For further information, visit our Support Center.

BEFORE YOU BEGIN

Ethics in publishing
Please see our information pages on Ethics in publishing and Ethical guidelines for journal publication.

If you have ethical concerns on a paper, whether published or in review, please contact the editor in the first instance. The editor will then follow the COPE guidelines as explained here https://www.elsevier.com/editors/publishing-ethics/perk/about-cope.

Declaration of interest
All authors must disclose any financial and personal relationships with other people or organizations that could inappropriately influence (bias) their work. Examples of potential competing interests include employment, consultancies, stock ownership, honoraria, paid expert testimony, patent applications/registrations, and grants or other funding. Authors must disclose any interests in two places: 1. A summary declaration of interest statement in the title page file (if double-blind) or the
manuscript file (if single-blind). If there are no interests to declare then please state this: 'Declarations of interest: none'. This summary statement will be ultimately published if the article is accepted. 2. Detailed disclosures as part of a separate Declaration of Interest form, which forms part of the journal's official records. It is important for potential interests to be declared in both places and that the information matches. More information.

Submission declaration and verification
Submission of an article implies that the work described has not been published previously (except in the form of an abstract, a published lecture or academic thesis, see 'Multiple, redundant or concurrent publication' for more information), that it is not under consideration for publication elsewhere, that its publication is approved by all authors and tacitly or explicitly by the responsible authorities where the work was carried out, and that, if accepted, it will not be published elsewhere in the same form, in English or in any other language, including electronically without the written consent of the copyright-holder. To verify originality, your article may be checked by the originality detection service Crossref Similarity Check.

Preprints
Please note that preprints can be shared anywhere at any time, in line with Elsevier's sharing policy. Sharing your preprints e.g. on a preprint server will not count as prior publication (see 'Multiple, redundant or concurrent publication' for more information).

Use of inclusive language
Inclusive language acknowledges diversity, conveys respect to all people, is sensitive to differences, and promotes equal opportunities. Articles should make no assumptions about the beliefs or commitments of any reader, should contain nothing which might imply that one individual is superior to another on the grounds of race, sex, culture or any other characteristic, and should use inclusive language throughout. Authors should ensure that writing is free from bias, for instance by using 'he or she', 'his/her' instead of 'he' or 'his', and by making use of job titles that are free of stereotyping (e.g. 'chairperson' instead of 'chairman' and 'flight attendant' instead of 'stewardess').

Author contributions
For transparency, we encourage authors to submit an author statement file outlining their individual contributions to the paper using the relevant CRediT roles: Conceptualization; Data curation; Formal analysis; Funding acquisition; Investigation; Methodology; Project administration; Resources; Software; Supervision; Validation; Visualization; Roles/Writing - original draft; Writing - review & editing. Authorship statements should be formatted with the names of authors first and CRediT role(s) following. More details and an example

Changes to authorship
Authors are expected to consider carefully the list and order of authors before submitting their manuscript and provide the definitive list of authors at the time of the original submission. Any addition, deletion or rearrangement of author names in the authorship list should be made only before the manuscript has been accepted and only if approved by the journal Editor. To request such a change, the Editor must receive the following from the corresponding author: (a) the reason for the change in author list and (b) written confirmation (e-mail, letter) from all authors that they agree with the addition, removal or rearrangement. In the case of addition or removal of authors, this includes confirmation from the author being added or removed. Only in exceptional circumstances will the Editor consider the addition, deletion or rearrangement of authors after the manuscript has been accepted. While the Editor considers the request, publication of the manuscript will be suspended. If the manuscript has already been published in an online issue, any requests approved by the Editor will result in a corrigendum.

Copyright
Upon acceptance of an article, authors will be asked to complete a 'Journal Publishing Agreement' (see more information on this). An e-mail will be sent to the corresponding author confirming receipt of the manuscript together with a 'Journal Publishing Agreement' form or a link to the online version of this agreement.

Subscribers may reproduce tables of contents or prepare lists of articles including abstracts for internal circulation within their institutions. Permission of the Publisher is required for resale or distribution outside the institution and for all other derivative works, including compilations and translations. If
excerpts from other copyrighted works are included, the author(s) must obtain written permission from the copyright owners and credit the source(s) in the article. Elsevier has preprinted forms for use by authors in these cases.

For gold open access articles: Upon acceptance of an article, authors will be asked to complete an 'Exclusive License Agreement' (more information). Permitted third party reuse of gold open access articles is determined by the author's choice of user license.

**Author rights**
As an author you (or your employer or institution) have certain rights to reuse your work. More information.

Elsevier supports responsible sharing
Find out how you can share your research published in Elsevier journals.

**Role of the funding source**
You are requested to identify who provided financial support for the conduct of the research and/or preparation of the article and to briefly describe the role of the sponsor(s), if any, in study design; in the collection, analysis and interpretation of data; in the writing of the report; and in the decision to submit the article for publication. If the funding source(s) had no such involvement then this should be stated.

**Open access**
Please visit our Open Access page for more information.

Elsevier Researcher Academy
Researcher Academy is a free e-learning platform designed to support early and mid-career researchers throughout their research journey. The "Learn" environment at Researcher Academy offers several interactive modules, webinars, downloadable guides and resources to guide you through the process of writing for research and going through peer review. Feel free to use these free resources to improve your submission and navigate the publication process with ease.

**Language (usage and editing services)**
Please write your text in good English (American or British usage is accepted, but not a mixture of these). Authors who feel their English language manuscript may require editing to eliminate possible grammatical or spelling errors and to conform to correct scientific English may wish to use the English Language Editing service available from Elsevier's Author Services.

**Submission**
Submission to this journal proceeds totally online and you will be guided stepwise through the creation and uploading of your files. The system automatically converts source files to a single PDF file of the article, which is used in the peer-review process. Please note that even though manuscript source files are converted to PDF files at submission for the review process, these source files are needed for further processing after acceptance. All correspondence, including notification of the Editor's decision and requests for revision, takes place by e-mail removing the need for a paper trail.

**Review Policy**
The review process for articles submitted to the Economics of Education Review will no longer be double blind. Authors are requested to include a title page with authors' names and affiliation. Reviewers will continue to be anonymous.

**ARTICLE TYPES**

**Full-Length Research Articles**
These articles are typically empirical in nature and deal with an important issue within the field of education economics. They should be divided into numbered sections (1., 2., 3...) and subsections (1.1.1, 1.1.2,...), beginning with an introduction that clearly states the purpose of the study while avoiding a detailed description of the previous literature. In addition to the introduction, full-length research articles typically include a background section, a methods section and/or a data section, a results section, and a section that concludes. Appendices should be identified as using capital letters (Appendix A, Appendix B...), and equations, tables and figures that appear in the appendices should be given separate numbering (e.g., Table A.1, Table A.2,...).
Replication Studies
The Economics of Education Review encourages the submission of studies that address the internal and/or external validity of a previously published article. For instance, authors could:

1. Demonstrate that published, significant findings are robust to changes in specification or the use of alternative data.

2. Report the failure to reproduce published findings using the same data, specification and econometric software. Authors of studies that fail to reproduce findings should provide evidence that an attempt was made to communicate and work with the author (or authors) of the original study.

3. Reproduce published findings, but show that these findings are not robust to changes in data, specification or software. There are no length requirements for replication studies. Authors of the original, published article will typically be given an opportunity to respond. The original article need not have appeared in the Economics of Education Review. A successful replication study will carefully characterize the original article with respect to its research question, methodology, and findings. Reviewers will be explicitly asked to comment on the importance of the original article.

Reviews
The Economics of Education Review encourages authors to submit manuscripts that review an empirical literature. Reviews should be timely, insightful and accessible to economists who are not experts in the field. Emphasis should be placed on recent developments while providing enough background for non-experts. Reviews should be divided into numbered sections (1., 2., 3…) and subsections (1.1.1, 1.1.2,…), beginning with an introduction that describes why the literature being reviewed should be of interest to the readers of the Economics of Education Review. Successful reviews describe the important issues within a particular literature, summarize what is known with regard to these issues, and detail any questions that remain unanswered. It is not required (or recommended) that authors provide meticulous descriptions of every study in the literature. Rather, authors are encouraged to focus on those studies that made substantial contributions.

Short Communications
Short Communications are typically 2 to 5 printed pages (about 6 to 12 manuscript pages) in length. They should be divided into numbered sections (1., 2., 3…) and subsections (1.1.1, 1.1.2,…), but need not include a detailed background section or literature review. Short Communications should not include more than 3 tables/figures.

PREPARATION
NEW SUBMISSIONS
Submission to this journal proceeds totally online and you will be guided stepwise through the creation and uploading of your files. The system automatically converts your files to a single PDF file, which is used in the peer-review process.

As part of the Your Paper Your Way service, you may choose to submit your manuscript as a single file to be used in the refereeing process. This can be a PDF file or a Word document, in any format or layout that can be used by referees to evaluate your manuscript. It should contain high enough quality figures for refereeing. If you prefer to do so, you may still provide all or some of the source files at the initial submission. Please note that individual figure files larger than 10 MB must be uploaded separately.

References
There are no strict requirements on reference formatting at submission. References can be in any style or format as long as the style is consistent. Where applicable, author(s) name(s), journal title/book title, chapter title/article title, year of publication, volume number/book chapter and the article number or pagination must be present. Use of DOI is highly encouraged. The reference style used by the journal will be applied to the accepted article by Elsevier at the proof stage. Note that missing data will be highlighted at proof stage for the author to correct.

Formatting Requirements
There are no strict formatting requirements, but all manuscripts should contain an Abstract, Highlights, Keywords, and an Introduction. Any videos and/or other supplementary material should be included in your initial submission for peer review purposes. Please divide the article into clearly defined, numbered sections. Figures and tables can be embedded in text or placed at the end of
the manuscript. Authors are advised to consult a recent issue of the journal (a free sample copy is available online at: http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/02727757) to become familiar with layout and formatting conventions.

**Figures and tables embedded in text**

Please ensure the figures and the tables included in the single file are placed next to the relevant text in the manuscript, rather than at the bottom or the top of the file. The corresponding caption should be placed directly below the figure or table.

**Peer review**

This journal operates a single blind review process. All contributions will be initially assessed by the editor for suitability for the journal. Papers deemed suitable are then typically sent to a minimum of two independent expert reviewers to assess the scientific quality of the paper. The Editor is responsible for the final decision regarding acceptance or rejection of articles. The Editor's decision is final. More information on types of peer review.

**REVISED SUBMISSIONS**

Use of Word Processing Software

Regardless of the file format of the original submission, at revision authors should provide an editable file of the entire article. Please keep the layout of the text as simple as possible. Most formatting codes will be removed and replaced upon processing the article. See the Guide to Publishing with Elsevier (https://www.elsevier.com/guidepublication) for more information. To avoid unnecessary errors you are strongly advised to use the 'spell-check' and 'grammar-check' functions of your word processor.

**ADDITIONAL INFORMATION**

**Essential title page information**

- **Title.** Concise and informative. Titles are often used in information-retrieval systems. Avoid abbreviations and formulae where possible.
- **Author names and affiliations.** Please clearly indicate the given name(s) and family name(s) of each author and check that all names are accurately spelled. You can add your name between parentheses in your own script behind the English transliteration. Present the authors' affiliation addresses (where the actual work was done) below the names. Indicate all affiliations with a lower-case superscript letter immediately after the author's name and in front of the appropriate address. Provide the full postal address of each affiliation, including the country name and, if available, the e-mail address of each author.
- **Corresponding author.** Clearly indicate who will handle correspondence at all stages of refereeing and publication, also post-publication. This responsibility includes answering any future queries about Methodology and Materials. **Ensure that the e-mail address is given and that contact details are kept up to date by the corresponding author.**
- **Present/permanent address.** If an author has moved since the work described in the article was done, or was visiting at the time, a 'Present address' (or 'Permanent address') may be indicated as a footnote to that author's name. The address at which the author actually did the work must be retained as the main, affiliation address. Superscript Arabic numerals are used for such footnotes.

**Essential title page information**

- **Title.** The title of your paper should be concise and informative. Titles are often used in information-retrieval systems. Please avoid using abbreviations and formulae in the title.
- **Author names and affiliations.** Where the family name may be ambiguous (e.g., a double name), please indicate this clearly. Present the authors' affiliation addresses (where the actual work was done) below the names. Indicate all affiliations with a lower-case superscript letter immediately after the author's name and in front of the appropriate address. Provide the full postal address of each affiliation, including the country name and, if available, the e-mail address of each author.
- **Corresponding author.** Clearly indicate who will handle correspondence at all stages of refereeing and publication, also post-publication. **Ensure that phone numbers (with country and area code) are provided in addition to the e-mail address and the complete postal address. Contact details must be kept up to date by the corresponding author.**
- **Present/permanent address.** If an author has moved since the work described in the article was done, or was visiting at the time, a 'Present address' (or 'Permanent address') may be indicated as a footnote to that author's name. The address at which the author actually did the work must be retained as the main, affiliation address. Superscript Arabic numerals are used for such footnotes.
**Highlights**

Highlights are mandatory for this journal as they help increase the discoverability of your article via search engines. They consist of a short collection of bullet points that capture the novel results of your research as well as new methods that were used during the study (if any). Please have a look at the examples here: example Highlights.

Highlights should be submitted in a separate editable file in the online submission system. Please use 'Highlights' in the file name and include 3 to 5 bullet points (maximum 85 characters, including spaces, per bullet point).

**Abstract**

A concise and factual abstract is required (maximum length 150 words). The abstract should state briefly the purpose of the research, the principal results and major conclusions. An abstract is often presented separate from the article, so it must be able to stand alone. References should therefore be avoided, but if essential, they must be cited in full, without reference to the reference list. Non-standard or uncommon abbreviations should be avoided, but if essential they must be defined at their first mention in the abstract itself.

**JEL Classifications**

Authors are requested to supply JEL (Journal of Economic Literature) Classifications (for more information, please see: http://www.aeaweb.org/journal/jel_class_system.html). At least one of the JEL Classifications must be in the I2 category.

**Keywords**

Immediately after the abstract, provide between 2-6 keywords to be chosen from the following list: costs, demand for schooling, economic development, economic impact, economies of scale, educational economics, educational finance, educational vouchers, efficiency, expenditures, grants, human capital, input output analysis, privatization, productivity, rate of return, resource allocation, salary wage differentials, school choice, state and federal aid, student financial aid, and teacher salaries. Authors may select alternative keywords that more accurately reflect the nature of their contribution. These keywords will be used for indexing purposes.

**Classification codes**

Please provide up to 6 standard JEL codes. The available codes may be accessed at JEL.

**Abbreviations**

Define abbreviations that are not standard in this field in a footnote to be placed on the first page of the article. Such abbreviations that are unavoidable in the abstract must be defined at their first mention there, as well as in the footnote. Ensure consistency of abbreviations throughout the article.

**Acknowledgements**

Collate acknowledgements in a separate section at the end of the article before the references and do not, therefore, include them on the title page, as a footnote to the title or otherwise. List here those individuals who provided help during the research (e.g., providing language help, writing assistance or proof reading the article, etc.). To assure anonymity, please remove any information that might identify you or your institution(s).

**Formatting of funding sources**

List funding sources in this standard way to facilitate compliance to funder's requirements:

Funding: This work was supported by the National Institutes of Health [grant numbers xxxx, yyyy]; the Bill & Melinda Gates Foundation, Seattle, WA [grant number zzzz]; and the United States Institutes of Peace [grant number aaaa].

It is not necessary to include detailed descriptions on the program or type of grants and awards. When funding is from a block grant or other resources available to a university, college, or other research institution, submit the name of the institute or organization that provided the funding.

If no funding has been provided for the research, please include the following sentence:
This research did not receive any specific grant from funding agencies in the public, commercial, or not-for-profit sectors.

Footnotes
Footnotes should be used sparingly. Number them consecutively throughout the article. Many word processors build footnotes into the text, and this feature may be used. Should this not be the case, indicate the position of footnotes in the text and present the footnotes themselves separately at the end of the article.

Artwork
Electronic artwork
General points
• Make sure you use uniform lettering and sizing of your original artwork.
• Preferred fonts: Arial (or Helvetica), Times New Roman (or Times), Symbol, Courier.
• Number the illustrations according to their sequence in the text.
• Use a logical naming convention for your artwork files.
• Indicate per figure if it is a single, 1.5 or 2-column fitting image.
• For Word submissions only, you may still provide figures and their captions, and tables within a single file at the revision stage.
• Please note that individual figure files larger than 10 MB must be provided in separate source files.

A detailed guide on electronic artwork is available.
You are urged to visit this site; some excerpts from the detailed information are given here.
Formats
Regardless of the application used, when your electronic artwork is finalized, please 'save as' or convert the images to one of the following formats (note the resolution requirements for line drawings, halftones, and line/halftone combinations given below):
EPS (or PDF): Vector drawings. Embed the font or save the text as 'graphics'.
TIFF (or JPEG): Color or grayscale photographs (halftones): always use a minimum of 300 dpi.
TIFF (or JPEG): Bmpamped line drawings: use a minimum of 1000 dpi.
TIFF (or JPEG): Combinations bitmapped line/half-tone (color or grayscale): a minimum of 500 dpi is required.
Please do not:
• Supply files that are optimized for screen use (e.g., GIF, BMP, PICT, WPG); the resolution is too low.
• Supply files that are too low in resolution.
• Submit graphics that are disproportionately large for the content.

Color artwork
Please make sure that artwork files are in an acceptable format (TIFF (or JPEG), EPS (or PDF), or MS Office files) and with the correct resolution. If, together with your accepted article, you submit usable color figures then Elsevier will ensure, at no additional charge, that these figures will appear in color online (e.g., ScienceDirect and other sites) regardless of whether or not these illustrations are reproduced in color in the printed version. For color reproduction in print, you will receive information regarding the costs from Elsevier after receipt of your accepted article. Please indicate your preference for color: in print or online only. Further information on the preparation of electronic artwork.

Figure captions
Ensure that each illustration has a caption. A caption should comprise a brief title (not on the figure itself) and a description of the illustration. Keep text in the illustrations themselves to a minimum but explain all symbols and abbreviations used.

Text graphics
Text graphics may be embedded in the text at the appropriate position. If you are working with LaTeX and have such features embedded in the text, these can be left. See further under Electronic artwork.

Tables
Please submit tables as editable text and not as images. Tables can be placed either next to the relevant text in the article, or on separate page(s) at the end. Number tables consecutively in accordance with their appearance in the text and place any table notes below the table body. Be sparing in the use of tables and ensure that the data presented in them do not duplicate results described elsewhere in the article. Please avoid using vertical rules and shading in table cells.

References
Citation in text
Please ensure that every reference cited in the text is also present in the reference list (and vice versa). Any references cited in the abstract must be given in full. Unpublished results and personal communications are not recommended in the reference list, but may be mentioned in the text. If these references are included in the reference list they should follow the standard reference style of the journal and should include a substitution of the publication date with either 'Unpublished results' or 'Personal communication'. Citation of a reference as 'in press' implies that the item has been accepted for publication.

Web references
As a minimum, the full URL should be given and the date when the reference was last accessed. Any further information, if known (DOI, author names, dates, reference to a source publication, etc.), should also be given. Web references can be listed separately (e.g., after the reference list) under a different heading if desired, or can be included in the reference list.

Data references
This journal encourages you to cite underlying or relevant datasets in your manuscript by citing them in your text and including a data reference in your Reference List. Data references should include the following elements: author name(s), dataset title, data repository, version (where available), year, and global persistent identifier. Add [dataset] immediately before the reference so we can properly identify it as a data reference. The [dataset] identifier will not appear in your published article.

References in a special issue
Please ensure that the words 'this issue' are added to any references in the list (and any citations in the text) to other articles in the same Special Issue.

Reference management software
Most Elsevier journals have their reference template available in many of the most popular reference management software products. These include all products that support Citation Style Language styles, such as Mendeley. Using citation plug-ins from these products, authors only need to select the appropriate journal template when preparing their article, after which citations and bibliographies will be automatically formatted in the journal's style. If no template is yet available for this journal, please follow the format of the sample references and citations as shown in this Guide. If you use reference management software, please ensure that you remove all field codes before submitting the electronic manuscript. More information on how to remove field codes from different reference management software.

Users of Mendeley Desktop can easily install the reference style for this journal by clicking the following link:
http://open.mendeley.com/use-citation-style/economics-of-education-review
When preparing your manuscript, you will then be able to select this style using the Mendeley plug-ins for Microsoft Word or LibreOffice.

Reference formatting
There are no strict requirements on reference formatting at submission. References can be in any style or format as long as the style is consistent. Where applicable, author(s) name(s), journal title/book title, chapter title/article title, year of publication, volume number/book chapter and the article number or pagination must be present. Use of DOI is highly encouraged. The reference style used by the journal will be applied to the accepted article by Elsevier at the proof stage. Note that missing data will be highlighted at proof stage for the author to correct. If you do wish to format the references yourself they should be arranged according to the following examples:

Reference Style
Text. Citations in the text should refer to the author's name (without initials) and the year of publication, e.g. "Since Peterson (1993) has shown that..." or "This is in agreement with results obtained later (Kramer, 1994)". For 2-6 authors, all authors are to be listed at first citation, with "&" separating the last two authors. For more than six authors, use the first six authors followed by et al. In subsequent citations for three or more authors use author et al. in the text.

List. References should be arranged first alphabetically and then further sorted chronologically if necessary. More than one reference from the same author(s) in the same year must be identified by the letters "a", "b", "c", etc., placed after the year of publication.

Examples:
Reference to a book

Reference to a chapter in an edited book

Reference to a journal publication

Reference style
Text: Citations in the text should follow the referencing style used by the American Psychological Association. You are referred to the Publication Manual of the American Psychological Association, Sixth Edition, ISBN 978-1-4338-0561-5, copies of which may be ordered online or APA Order Dept., P.O.B. 2710, Hyattsville, MD 20784, USA or APA, 3 Henrietta Street, London, WC3E 8LU, UK.

List: references should be arranged first alphabetically and then further sorted chronologically if necessary. More than one reference from the same author(s) in the same year must be identified by the letters 'a', 'b', 'c', etc., placed after the year of publication.

Examples:
Reference to a journal publication:

Reference to a journal publication with an article number:

Reference to a book:

Reference to a chapter in an edited book:

Reference to a website:

Reference to a dataset:

Reference to a conference paper or poster presentation:

Video
Elsevier accepts video material and animation sequences to support and enhance your scientific research. Authors who have video or animation files that they wish to submit with their article are strongly encouraged to include links to these within the body of the article. This can be done in the same way as a figure or table by referring to the video or animation content and noting in the body text where it should be placed. All submitted files should be properly labeled so that they directly relate to the video file's content. In order to ensure that your video or animation material is directly usable, please provide the file in one of our recommended file formats with a preferred maximum size of 150 MB per file, 1 GB in total. Video and animation files supplied will be published online in the electronic version of your article in Elsevier Web products, including ScienceDirect. Please supply 'stills' with your files: you can choose any frame from the video or animation or make a separate image. These will be used instead of standard icons and will personalize the link to your video data. For
more detailed instructions please visit our video instruction pages. Note: since video and animation cannot be embedded in the print version of the journal, please provide text for both the electronic and the print version for the portions of the article that refer to this content.

**Data visualization**
Include interactive data visualizations in your publication and let your readers interact and engage more closely with your research. Follow the instructions here to find out about available data visualization options and how to include them with your article.

**Supplementary material**
Supplementary material such as applications, images and sound clips, can be published with your article to enhance it. Submitted supplementary items are published exactly as they are received (Excel or PowerPoint files will appear as such online). Please submit your material together with the article and supply a concise, descriptive caption for each supplementary file. If you wish to make changes to supplementary material during any stage of the process, please make sure to provide an updated file. Do not annotate any corrections on a previous version. Please switch off the 'Track Changes' option in Microsoft Office files as these will appear in the published version.

**Research data**
This journal encourages and enables you to share data that supports your research publication where appropriate, and enables you to interlink the data with your published articles. Research data refers to the results of observations or experimentation that validate research findings. To facilitate reproducibility and data reuse, this journal also encourages you to share your software, code, models, algorithms, protocols, methods and other useful materials related to the project.

Below are a number of ways in which you can associate data with your article or make a statement about the availability of your data when submitting your manuscript. If you are sharing data in one of these ways, you are encouraged to cite the data in your manuscript and reference list. Please refer to the "References" section for more information about data citation. For more information on depositing, sharing and using research data and other relevant research materials, visit the research data page.

**Data linking**
If you have made your research data available in a data repository, you can link your article directly to the dataset. Elsevier collaborates with a number of repositories to link articles on ScienceDirect with relevant repositories, giving readers access to underlying data that gives them a better understanding of the research described.

There are different ways to link your datasets to your article. When available, you can directly link your dataset to your article by providing the relevant information in the submission system. For more information, visit the database linking page.

For supported data repositories a repository banner will automatically appear next to your published article on ScienceDirect.

In addition, you can link to relevant data or entities through identifiers within the text of your manuscript, using the following format: Database: xxxx (e.g., TAIR: AT1G01020; CCDC: 734053; PDB: 1XFN).

**Mendeley Data**
This journal supports Mendeley Data, enabling you to deposit any research data (including raw and processed data, video, code, software, algorithms, protocols, and methods) associated with your manuscript in a free-to-use, open access repository. During the submission process, after uploading your manuscript, you will have the opportunity to upload your relevant datasets directly to Mendeley Data. The datasets will be listed and directly accessible to readers next to your published article online.

For more information, visit the Mendeley Data for journals page.

**Data in Brief**
You have the option of converting any or all parts of your supplementary or additional raw data into one or multiple data articles, a new kind of article that houses and describes your data. Data articles ensure that your data is actively reviewed, curated, formatted, indexed, given a DOI and publicly available to all upon publication. You are encouraged to submit your article for Data in Brief as an additional item directly alongside the revised version of your manuscript. If your research article is
accepted, your data article will automatically be transferred over to Data in Brief where it will be editorially reviewed and published in the open access data journal, Data in Brief. Please note an open access fee of 600 USD is payable for publication in Data in Brief. Full details can be found on the Data in Brief website. Please use this template to write your Data in Brief.

Data statement
To foster transparency, we encourage you to state the availability of your data in your submission. This may be a requirement of your funding body or institution. If your data is unavailable to access or unsuitable to post, you will have the opportunity to indicate why during the submission process, for example by stating that the research data is confidential. The statement will appear with your published article on ScienceDirect. For more information, visit the Data Statement page.

AFTER ACCEPTANCE
Availability of accepted article
This journal makes articles available online as soon as possible after acceptance. This concerns the Journal Pre-proofs (both in HTML and PDF format), which have undergone enhancements after acceptance, such as the addition of a cover page and metadata, and formatting for readability, but are not yet the definitive versions of record. A Digital Object Identifier (DOI) is allocated, thereby making it fully citable and searchable by title, author name(s) and the full text. The article’s PDF also carries a disclaimer stating that it is an unedited article. Subsequent production stages will simply replace this version.

Online proof correction
To ensure a fast publication process of the article, we kindly ask authors to provide us with their proof corrections within two days. Corresponding authors will receive an e-mail with a link to our online proofing system, allowing annotation and correction of proofs online. The environment is similar to MS Word: in addition to editing text, you can also comment on figures/tables and answer questions from the Copy Editor. Web-based proofing provides a faster and less error-prone process by allowing you to directly type your corrections, eliminating the potential introduction of errors. If preferred, you can still choose to annotate and upload your edits on the PDF version. All instructions for proofing will be given in the e-mail we send to authors, including alternative methods to the online version and PDF.

We will do everything possible to get your article published quickly and accurately. Please use this proof only for checking the typesetting, editing, completeness and correctness of the text, tables and figures. Significant changes to the article as accepted for publication will only be considered at this stage with permission from the Editor. It is important to ensure that all corrections are sent back to us in one communication. Please check carefully before replying, as inclusion of any subsequent corrections cannot be guaranteed. Proofreading is solely your responsibility.

Offprints
The corresponding author will, at no cost, receive a customized Share Link providing 50 days free access to the final published version of the article on ScienceDirect. The Share Link can be used for sharing the article via any communication channel, including email and social media. For an extra charge, paper offprints can be ordered via the offprint order form which is sent once the article is accepted for publication. Both corresponding and co-authors may order offprints at any time via Elsevier’s Author Services. Corresponding authors who have published their article gold open access do not receive a Share Link as their final published version of the article is available open access on ScienceDirect and can be shared through the article DOI link.

Additional Information
Discount
Authors are entitled to a 30% discount on Elsevier books (excluding major reference works).

Fast Electronic Publication
Once the article has been proofed by the author, it will be published immediately on the journal’s ‘Articles in Press’ section on ScienceDirect, thus making it available to subscribers to read and cite. For more information, visit: http://www.sciencedirect.com/science/journal/02727757.

AUTHOR INQUIRIES
Visit the Elsevier Support Center to find the answers you need. Here you will find everything from Frequently Asked Questions to ways to get in touch.
You can also check the status of your submitted article or find out when your accepted article will be published.

Appeals
The editors of the Economics of Education Review will consider appeals. However, it should be noted that less than 10 percent of appeals actually lead to overturning the original editorial decision.

If you believe that a decision to reject was made in error, please send a letter of appeal to the Editor-in-Chief, Daniel Rees, at Daniel.Rees@ucdenver.edu. Please include detailed responses to the comments of the reviewers and/or the comments of the editor that handled your manuscript. In general, appeals that provide more information or clarify a specific point have a higher success rate than appeals that take issue with an editorial decision based on fit or lack of contribution.

Please note that an invitation to submit a revised version of your manuscript after an appeal is not a guarantee of acceptance. Your manuscript will be subject to further review and may ultimately be rejected.

© Copyright 2018 Elsevier | https://www.elsevier.com